

Language of Resistance: Social Movements and Online Artist Projects

Ms. Tuğçe OKLAY • tugceoklay@gmail.com

University of Paris VIII (Vincennes – Saint-Denis, France)

PhD Candidate EDESTA – Ecole Doctorale Esthétique Sciences et Technologies des Arts

Keywords: Artivism, internet, occupy movements, language, media.

Abstract: Ever since we have been spending a remarkable amount of time on the internet as urban people, an interesting phenomenon became noticeable: the relationship between online *artist* projects and social movements. Artists do activism by means of art; they use various traditional or untraditional mediums, some of which are culture jamming, subvertising, street art, spoken word, protesting. In this paper we will be analyzing online artist productions that are related to the resistance movements in USA, Greece, Spain, Tunisia, Egypt and Turkey. The crisis is not only economical but also cultural; today, the financial world, the multinational companies invaded our lives. The social movements are not only questioning governors as to why they do not find solutions but also criticizing this ill-considered model of globalization. These movements also target the "idealized" life promoted by the system. This paper aims to understand 'new social movements' and 'creative' resistance, and to observe the ancestors of the *artist* projects (especially net art projects of the 1990s in USA and in Europe). This new generation of activists has a new common language; their productions in the streets and on the internet are intelligent and ironic. We try to analyze the use of language and the transnational character of the language in social movements and their online repercussion (hoax news websites, fake personalities, hacking-code writing, manipulated posters and memes).

Introduction

Our PhD research aims to establish a theoretical reading of "contemporary" online content in the light of aesthetic theories. We analyze online artist productions and website projects which are linked to resistance movements from 2008 (the great recession) to 2014, the United States, Greece, Spain, Tunisia, Egypt and Turkey. In our research, we investigate the relationship between daily life, politics, the arts and aesthetics using the aesthetic experience notion from John Dewey, the distancing effect from Bertolt Brecht and *dissensus* of Jacques Rancière. We aim to analyze and explain

the reaction of artists and/or non-artists to everyday life events and their production in relation to their observations of everyday life, political space and society in general.

We also aim to portray new materials of production and the concept of language in those projects; training and use of language as an artistic material and as a message. Language as “material” means computer code, some hacktivist acts or electronic sit-ins while written content or shared images mean “messages”. Our study offers a comparative approach between different web projects, projects recognized as works of art as well as “popular” projects on social networking sites: fake news websites, fake personalities, acts of hacking, virtual performances, manipulated posters and memes, pirate TVs and radios. It is also an analysis of the communities, the initiators and content producers of these websites and projects. We are asking two main questions: Is it possible to make an aesthetic reading of such productions? What do these creative/artistic projects say on our daily life, the political and social space? How to interpret them?

In all those projects we may see the awakening effect even if it that was not the project’s first intention. One of the criticisms addressed to such projects is that they are not targeting a real change. However we are not interested whether what we analyze aims to achieve a real change or is simply cynical or satirical. We are interested in the *dissensus*, the disruptive language they built, so that the aesthetic experience and alienation effect might be created.

Given the content of our research and the methodology, we adapt an interdisciplinary approach. Our research focuses on four main areas closely related to each other: 1) The importance of the new information and communication technologies and the change in

society (the transition from industrial to post-industrial), 2) The relationship between the concept of language, the arts and activism, in light of existing literature, 3) Analysis of former "networked art" practices and online activism projects, 4) The case study to analyze selected projects or websites.

These questions demand qualitative and quantitative analysis of data. In our research, we based on semi-structured interviews and participant and non-participant observation as appropriate methods to explore practitioners' perspectives due to the qualitative nature of the information. Our case studies provide us a systematic way of looking at online artist productions by collecting data, analyzing information, and reporting the results. Therefore we adopted data analysis and text mining methods.

In this article we will try to summarize just a part of our research, we will first mention the new forms of actions and "creative" mobilizations which precede the latest ones. Secondly, we will give examples that have created transnational exchanges and examples of transition between the street and the web. Finally, we are going to describe the language created in Turkey in the streets and online.

New modalities of action, new directories, "creative" protests

In parallel to our inquiries about the internet, social networks, digital arts, there have been consecutive riots in several countries especially following the great recession 2008 until late 2014. The causes and consequences of those riots or movements differ. As Tilly (1977) mentioned forms and repertoires of social movements vary with time and structure of the society in which they occur. But, there are also commonalities that seem interesting to discover: these are young people who took the streets; they ask not only labor rights in

the conventional sense but they demand a solution to the austerity and insecurity; they demand individual freedom and respect to the *right to the city*, to their spaces, to their bodies, to their choices, etc. Tilly shows that modalities of action also vary according to historical moments especially in the moments of fundamental changes such as industrialization, urbanization, etc. (1977, p.50). In our case this fundamental change can be considered as transition to the information age. We state that the past hegemonic actors (states, political parties, and unions) couldn't not yet adapt to the information age. On the opposite side, the new generations are capable of building and transforming the cyber culture, and they adapted their selves to post-industrial era. That's how the balance shifted to the people who are open to innovate and have cultural capital to apply those innovations; the balance then in a longer term shifted to the companies who hire those people. As a result, hegemony (in the sense we know) is changing hands, today we witness to this struggle between individuals (or small collectives), corporate enterprises, existing political organizations and states, so that we also witness 'new social movements' as a result of this hegemonic crisis.

These new protests differ from past political movements. Erik Neveu (1996) cites four dimensions of this break: **1) forms of organization and repertoires** (hostility towards centralization, playful approach, looking for innovation, support for a single subject) **2) values and claims** (less economic, more qualitative; importance of more qualitative and expressive claims, such as lifestyles, identity, enhancement of body, desire or nature), **the will to escape from rationalization and development of autonomy** **3) relationship to politics** (challenge or seize the state (union/party duo, access to *polity* in Tilly's terms), reaffirm the independence of sociability forms); **4) identity of their actors** (Not anymore

1st International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences - Rethymno, 10 - 12 June 2016
Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives

class identities, but groups defined by characteristics: women, homosexuals, Breton, “ami de la terre”¹, ... – actors belong to the salaried middle classes). According to Alain Bertho (2009), “[...] for rioters of twenty-first century we may refer to a divorce among peoples and states, the collapse of institutional and subjective features of social and political representation. [...] It is oppressed youth or youth as a whole, who manifests its existence [...] If it evokes a crisis of representation, rather it is a divorce between peoples and States that should be addressed.”

Places are important for these movements - Tahrir Square, Gezi Park, Wall Street, Maïdan (Göle, 2014). In her brief and illuminating article Tali Hatuka (2011) writes about the circular rallies: “*The fundamental decision underlying the design of any protest concerns the spatial interaction among participants and its symbolic meaning. This decision is crucial in intensifying the solidarity among participants. For example, a speaker standing at the centre of a circular space projects a message of being part of the crowd and emerging from it, as opposed to a speaker standing on a high podium at the edge of a rectangular space, evoking distinct hierarchy and theatricality. [...] Leadership in this case is not concentrated but distributed.*” This new model is therefore horizontal, and proposes alternative ways of production and consumption, lifestyle(s) such as Freecycle exchanges, bitcoin, etc. In the next section, we will be discovering how we have been conducted to this changing world.

¹ A French ecologist group.

Examples of transnational exchanges and ‘real life precursors’ inspired web projects

The transition from industrial to post-industrial society means the change of societal organization accordingly subordination of the materials (raw material, machinery) to intangibles (knowledge and information). Alain Touraine (2005) indicated this change through the title of his book “a new paradigm” which questions the material paradigm of industrial society. To determine a date for this change, we may refer to Jean-François Lyotard and Jean Baudrillard, both mention the years 1960/1970 for the origin of passage from ideological movements/meta-narrative to non-ideological movements/micro-narrative. According to Castells (1999), this transformation is achieved through “[...] *a historical coincidence of three independent processes: the information technology revolution; the economic crisis of both capitalism and statism, and their subsequent restructuring; and the blooming of cultural social movements.*”

There has been in history previous occupations that could be cited as civil disobedience activities. For example, *Reclaim the Streets* (from 1995 to 2003, mostly in the UK) is a collective with a shared ideal of community ownership of public spaces. They are opposed to the dominance of companies in globalization and the domination of cars as a mode of transport.² The “nobody is illegal” network also established the first noborder camp at the German-Polish border in 1998 and began a powerful anti-deportation campaign against Lufthansa. We should also be mentioning the usage of giant puppets in several manifestations as a playful and effective way of blocking streets (Graeber, 2011). In another case, nearly 25 people occupied a Starbucks store in Berkeley (Saturday, August 17 2002), claiming Berkeley as " a city without people for people without a city",

² To give an example, they once occupied a highway and planted trees.

the group called attention on Israeli settlements in Palestine. They displayed a banner proclaiming the occupied cafe is called "Queerkeley: a prophecy fulfilled." They hooked signs such as "it works in Palestine, why not here "and" It is ours, because we say so."

Humor has an important role in these new forms of action. In 1968, the Chicago 7 trial of antiwar activists (who had been accused of conspiracy, incitement to rebellion and other charges related to the events), turned into a circus as the defendants and their lawyers used the court as a stage to attack Nixon, war, racism and oppression. Their tactics were so disruptive that at one point the judge ordered Hoffman Seale gagged and tied to his chair.

In 1994, 50,000 Indian farmers of Karnataka spent a whole day laughing at government offices, to oust corruption. The government collapsed the following week. In Mexico in 1999, the *Zapatista Air Force* launched an attack to a military fortress with hundreds of paper airplanes, on each written: "Soldiers, we know that poverty has made you sell your lives and souls. I also am poor, as are millions. But you are worse off, for defending our exploiter -- [President] Zedillo and his group of money bags." This action reminded us directly a slogan from Gezi movement in Turkey 2013, "Polis, simit sat, onurlu yaşa!" (Police, sell simit, live in an honorable way)³.

Manipulating posters especially movie posters and advertisements is one way of criticizing the economic and cultural system, like culture jamming, subvertising, street art, spoken word, protesting. For recent and online examples, we can mention the *memes* and also Bobiler community from Turkey. Bobiler is an online platform where users can

³ Simit is Turkish bagel which is probably the cheapest food in Turkey, might even cheaper than bread.

share images or animated gifs they have created or manipulated, their products are much more “sophisticated” in comparison to ordinary internet users. In this website and in these productions, we can observe a common language. To analyze these communities, we do not have enough data for age, sex and city dwelling but we take some tools and methodologies of digital humanities, we do text mining and as a result we have an opportunity to adopt critical discourse analysis. We also track digitally frequencies and periods of production of users by extracting information from websites.

In the 1990s, creating fake personalities was trendy: Luther Blissett, Darko Maver (one of 0100101110101101.org projects), Harry Kipper were already known by their mystified stories. Yes Men of RTMark is also one of the well known examples of fraudulent characters: two militants, Jacques Servin and Igor Vamos (aka Andy Bichlbaum and Mike Bonanno) who caricaturize and criticize liberalism and the global economic system by making satirical presentations on behalf the World Trade Organization (WTO) and in the name of Dow chemicals (a widely protested multinational chemical company). Yes Men constructed fake sites which prank the originals, they made one for George Bush (no longer available), and their fake WTO website is still accessible. These are the same persons who published and distributed fake copies of New York Times entitled "The Iraq war is over". In their projects, we see a critique of political and economic system, but also the media and sources of information and of contemporary society.

Even if the latest examples were artist groups' projects, some of the activist projects are linked to social movements or disobedience activities. For example, in the case of Turkey, we can cite two interesting examples in 1990s: The Saturday Mothers

(*Cumartesi Anneleri* since 1995) and One Minute of Darkness for the eternal light (*Sürekli Aydınlik İcin Bir dakika Karanlık* in 1997 following the Susurluk case where the corrupt relationship between the state, the politicians, and the mafia was unveiled).⁴ The latter was repeated in 2003 by activists against the war in Iraq, but not really attended. Saturday Mothers was similar in form and pattern to Mothers of Plaza de Mayo (Argentina, since 1977). A minute of darkness has similarities with the act of civil disobedience in Poland in 1983. James C. Scott (1990) explains the act: *“The union (supporters of Solidarnosc) in the city of Lodz decided that in order to demonstrate their disdain for the lies propagated by the official government television news, they would all take a daily promenade timed to coincide exactly with the broadcast, wearing their hats backwards. Soon, much of the town had joined them. [...] the authorities shifted the hours of the Lodz curfew so that a promenade at that hour became illegal. In response, for some time, many Lodz residents took their televisions to the window at precisely die time the government newscast began and beamed them out at full volume into empty courtyards and streets. A passerby, who in this case would have had to have been art officer of the "security forces, was greeted by the eerie sight of working-class housing flats with a television at nearly every window blaring the government's message at him.”*

We will continue with some recent examples from Turkey: in 2007, during the parliamentary elections, a group named %52 declared a fictitious program for elections in the name of "Allah Hepsinin Belasını Versin Partisi" (All be damned party), their language was satirical and asked voters not to vote for existing political parties. %52 was

⁴ We do not include the Republic Protests and demonstrations organized by AKP (Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi - the Justice and Development Party).

1st International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences - Rethymno, 10 - 12 June 2016
Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives

an allusion to Guy Fawkes, yet their way of reaction and political recklessness have been criticized repeatedly. What is different today from such communities, especially with online social networks such productions can circulate easily and reach more people, and communities are much more open to the participation of individuals non-attached to certain groups. The same group had published and distributed a flyer in 2006 entitled “People do not die in Iraq” in the name of “Club of people who scared to tell the truth” (Gerçekleri Söylemekten Tırsanlar Kulübü).

In 2006, the Surveillance Camera Players (Gözetleme Kamerası Oyuncuları) began organizing *Nobese Festival* where they criticize with performances and humorous signs the installation of 570 surveillance cameras in Istanbul. Who triggered the movement around the world was a New York collective "Surveillance Camera Players", a small informal group which is unconditionally opposed to the installation and use of video surveillance cameras in public places. The group has adapted nine works of performance before the surveillance cameras were installed in public (including adaptations of George Orwell's 1984 and The Mass Psychology of Fascism Wilhelm Reich) and wrote seven original pieces. Over the years, other SCP groups were trained in Tempe (AZ); San Francisco (CA); Stockholm (Sweden); Bologna (Italy); Istanbul (Turkey); and Vilnius (Lithuania); there was coordination between these groups. However, these are not only groups of activists and/or artists who organize those kinds of collective actions. Ertur (2008) cites those two examples: in 2007 a group of merchants in İzmir has have transformed a hole and excavations left by public sanctuary team. Again in 2007, a nationwide TV channel SKY Turk broadcasted only insignificant news during the

evening news following the Radio and Television Supreme Council's press black out about the soldiers who lost their lives.

Lastly, we should allude to *LAF* (*Liseli Anarsist Faaliyet* - Anarchist High Schooler Action), a group gathered behind a banner after the assassination of Alexis in Greece in 2009. After changing the name of "Kenan Evren High School" to "Erdal Eren High School" on the night of September 10, 2009⁵; in 2013 they changed a few other school names with the names of young people who were killed during Gezi resistance. In 2010, they boycotted a school canteen by sharing meals they brought. It reminds us "yeryüzü sofraları" (common evening meal breaking the fast on Istiklal Street in summer of 2013 during Ramadan). While it is clear that both actions were already part of new social movements' directories, it is worth to emphasize that these kinds of actions existed before Gezi. In the next section we will be discussing the role of language in politics, and resistance movements and will be giving examples.

Language created in resistance movements: case of Turkey before and after Gezi

We investigate new materials of production (new media, internet, social media, etc.) and training and usage of language as an artistic material and as a message in activist internet projects. Language as a "material" means computer code, acts of piracy or electronic sit-ins; while a "message" means written content and messages behind shared images. We may refer to a struggle of language between the authorities and the protestors/resistants, the authorities adopt a pejorative language for the protestors and in response the

⁵ Kenan Evren led the military coup of 12 September 1980, following the coup hundreds of thousands of people arrested, about 250 000 indicted, 50 of them sentenced to death and executed (one was Erdal Eren who was 17 years old at that time, but was registered 2 years older. Military Supreme Council rejected the bone test to determine his actual age). Dozens more people died in prison under torture and tens of thousands took the road to exile.

protestors find humoristic and ironic strategies to fight against in this battle. For our research, the first important point is the medium(s) and their role in this struggle. The second important element is the satirical or humoristic language, the neologisms and the *détournements*.

Lachaud (2009, p.144) refers to Marcuse: “[...] *negative and constructive power of disruptive expressions of counter-culture can not be build unless a double necessity is realized: dismiss/reject the dominant language and invent a new one. This subversive character tends to destroy the historical function of art, then cites Marcuse “It is the effort to find forms of communication that may break the oppressive rule of the established language and images over the mind and body of man – language and images which have long since become a means of domination, indoctrination, and deception.”*”. The language of the oppressed, for him, has a natural affinity to protest and refusal. “*The language of the black strengthens solidarity, the consciousness of their identity, and of their repressed or distorted cultural tradition.*” (Marcuse, 1972, p.80) Marcuse emphasizes that today there is a break with the bourgeois tradition of art, like Jacques Rancière’s “the new regime of art”. According to Marcuse, this is a serious but also a popular break, he adds that the new 'open' forms or 'free forms' express not only a new style but also a change in the world of art, a change in the historical function of the art (p.80-82). Herein, in our research we refer to *dissensus* and the *aesthetic regime* of Jacques Rancière (2009a, 2009b) and *aesthetic experience* of John Dewey (1934).

According to Dewey, the fundamental element of the process of artistic expression is no longer the material work of art but rather the development of an experience. For Dewey

(1934), there is also an aesthetic aspect in ‘non-aesthetic’ productions and relations. An aesthetic experience cannot be held separate from everyday life experiences and the purpose of the aesthetics is to ensure the continuity between the refined art experience and daily life experience. For Rancière (2009a, p.5) an aesthetic experience is “a reconfiguration of the forms of visibility and intelligibility of artistic practice and its reception.” An artwork is “given in a specific experience, which suspends the ordinary connections, not only between appearance and reality, but also between form and matter, activity and passivity, understanding and sensibility.” (Rancière, 2009b, p.30) Dewey’s and Rancière’s writings give us a new perspective on the relations between daily life, aesthetics and art; and enable us to establish this relation in today’s productions. In analyzed projects, today’s productions, we observed significance and communality of the language.

Young people have a new common language, their products in the streets and online are intelligent and ironic; these productions also have their own language(s). Especially in case of online producers, we observed that in general they have a communitarian language. J.G.A. Pocock (1973, p.41) defines the ambiguities, contradictions and absurdities in languages as elements to discover to exploit not only for satire but also to break free from the life styles imposed upon us. From this perspective, we notice that the online activist productions correspond to that goal. Moreover, when there is an engaging street movement, or an issue, online productions proliferate.

Language as a resistance tool has always been used against the status quo ‘or conservatism’, it is therefore not surprising that we come across the same tool in the new

social movements. What is interesting is to see similar humoristic references in different social movements, or in different web projects. According to J.C. Scott (1985), language is part of “everyday forms of peasant resistance” as it has always been used in popular literature and culture. We observed that this new resistance or occupy languages are also positioned away from the language of the authority, the power, but also of the traditional left and right. In case of Turkey, we noticed that this new language did not appear suddenly but it has been built since the protests to protect Emek (an old cinema in city center), against internet censorship; it is also the result of the weekly satirical magazines (LeMan, Uykusuz, Penguen, etc.), and even recent websites (Eksisözlük, Zaytung, Bobiler, etc.)

According to Pocock (1973), we can talk about verbalization as a political action and verbalization of a political action. He gives the example of how Brutus justified his killing Caesar by calling him a "tyrant". (p.29) Pocock added “*Verbalizations act upon people-and so constitute acts of power-in at least two ways: either by informing them and so modifying their perceptions or by defining them and so modifying the ways in which they are perceived by others.*” (p.30) During Gezi movement, Prime Minister of the time Recep Tayyip Erdogan called the opponents "marginal", "thugs", the "scums" (çapulcu), "drunkards" (ayyaş) to intimidate the resistants and to consolidate his supporters (Göle, 2014). There was a similar negative propaganda against social media: Zeynep Tüfekçi (2014, p.7) pointed out “*The bans, however, and the demonization campaign – in which government officials repeatedly called social media a “force for evil,” a “destroyer of families,” a “purveyor of child pornography,” and a “haven for treason” – were aimed*

more to solidify government supporters than to target opponents, because the charges were so hyperbolic.”

But, on the other side, the resisters also used the same strategy against the hegemony. As stated by Pocock (1972, p.35), written also by Marcuse, language is an effective medium for communication and political action because “it is relatively uncontrollable and too difficult to monopolize”. Following the marginalizing speeches of the authorities, the protesters created examples of diversion and neologism in this language battle/struggle.⁶ The word "çapulcu" was quickly recaptured by the demonstrators, both original and anglicized versions, for the sense "one who fights for their rights." Chapulling (Turkish: çapuling) is probably the most interesting example for neologism in Gezi protests. This originally negatively connoted term was transformed to a positive one and used for self-definition. The word was adopted by online protesters and activists, especially after a viral video was widely broadcasted. International supporters (such as linguist and political critic Noam Chomsky) posted photos on social media, holding signs written "I'm a chapuller too" (in their own languages). Another interesting phenomenon regarding the question of language; online Turkish-English dictionary *Zargan* adopted this new word 'chapulling' in their dictionary. The word çapulcu was also added to the *Urban Dictionary* and *Tureng*. A “pirate TV channel” was launched under the name Çapul TV and it broadcasted live from Gezi Park (on Ustream). After the evacuation of the park the channel continued to broadcast from local forums and still operates from a studio. This experience of pirate channel also corresponds with the experiences of pirate radio and

⁶ Here we refer to Henri Lefebvre (1958) to understand the parallelism between this language struggle and the struggle in *spaces* such as streets, cities, parks and cyberspace.

1st International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences - Rethymno, 10 - 12 June 2016
Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives

television stations in the 1990s (in Italy and Eastern Europe where there have been several discussions on hack and hacktivism at that time).

Apart from neologism, Perin Gurel (2015, p.1) mentions Anglicism in the Gezi resistance: *“The incongruity between these two types of anonymity – one rebellious, masculine, and Hollywood-born, and the other domestic, feminine, and perceived to be deeply local – was emphasized in the bilingual label that attended the image: “V for Teyzetta [Auntie- etta].”* She also gives the example of graffiti "Just in Biber" based on a bilingual joke for the Turkish word for pepper *biber* (as in the pepper gas, *biber gazi*) and the famous pop singer Justin Bieber. *“[...] The humor lies in the doubly layered pun, as well as the juxtaposition of the vision of a glitzy young singer with that of protestors choking on excessive pepper gas”* she writes (p.13). The author reminds us that bilingual humor was also a part of the Turkish humor since at least the end of the Ottoman Empire, humor based on linguistic misunderstandings between different classes and ethnic groups appear in the shadow puppetry and joke cycles even earlier (p.11). We may add that references to the popular American television series or movies were visible above all in the park and in Istanbul. *“Bu gaz bir harika dostum!”* (This gas is fantastic bro – Hollywood way), *“Tayyip, Winter Is Coming”* (referring to Game of Thrones series), reference to Punk culture *“God Save the Sultan”*.

Regarding the visual language, penguins have become symbols of resistance to criticize the media following CNN Turk’s choice to air a documentary about penguins instead of showing images and news from Gezi movement. The standing man and rainbow stairs have also become visual symbols (even repeated out of Istanbul, in different cities and

countries). Some other visuals, especially tags on the walls, are also important in contact with other movements from various countries. In Tunisia, for example, we saw tags or graffiti but not so many online productions. We may refer to an iconography of these recent social movements, “poetics of resistance”, especially femininity. Lisiak (2014) gives following examples: Occupy Wall Street poster with the ballerina and the bull; the whirling dervish, the woman in red and the woman who resists against the water cannon in Turkey; the girl wearing blue bras in Egypt. We may even add, the young man reading a book to police, youth who construct the space working hand in hand, the mothers’ guard, etc. As our main subject is the online productions, in the next and final section we will discover the online examples from Turkey which are inspired by above-mentioned social movements, and also by the earlier activist artistic actions. In those online productions we will be re-exploring the common humoristic and critical language of the social movements and transnational dimension of this language.

A brief resume of online activist projects in Turkey

One of the projects that we observe is hoax news websites: The Onion (USA), Le Gorafi (France), News That Matters Not (India), El Koshary Today (Egypt), Zaytung (Turkey), etc. These websites question the 'realities' of everyday life and politics. They interrogate both the media’s attitude about disinformation and the truthfulness of the news broadcasted by mass media organs. We consider that these sites also criticize the lifestyle promoted for middle class workers, especially for those who work in *bullshit jobs*, referring to Graeber (2013) to describe jobs in the services sector which does not lead to an actual production. We argue that their production can be considered as awakener, their content offers a moment of alienation, a *distancing effect* or *estrangement effect* (Brecht,

1st International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences - Rethymno, 10 - 12 June 2016
Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives

Language of Resistance: Social Movements and Online Activist Projects

p. 17

1936). We may also read texts published on those websites by Dadaists' claim: "*Art should not be an escape from daily events, but rather it should make visible the violence, chaos, and hypocrisies of contemporary life.*" (Dada, 2009)

Fake personalities or fake candidates for elections are also another phenomenon. In local elections of March 2014, there was a candidate 'Şafak Başgan' who led a campaign by creating a satirical personality, especially by using social media (Facebook and Twitter). His project was born in reaction to gentrification policies of the city of Istanbul and "crazy project" of the government. His campaign's visuals, videos and language are worth to analyze as once more in this case, we can read those materials as awakeners and détournements. His campaign criticized the political scene, the existing parties, and neoliberal politics applied by the government and the mayor of Istanbul. During the same regional election, in Ankara, a group of activist *Avareler* stuck ironic and humorous posters to the billboards of the municipality of Ankara (without permission), on behalf of a party that does not exist, Bal Porsukları Partisi (The badgers' party).

In cyberspace, we had seen electronic sit-ins on Googlemaps when discussing the company's new Internet law and censorship in 2011 (like the performances of Electronic Disturbance Theater). Anonymous like hacker group *RedHack* (active since 2005) took down some government websites and captured information leakage in some operations. In 2013, during the Gezi resistance, the same group hacked the screens inside a public transport (public bus in Istanbul), to announce that the resistance will continue. They displayed the sentence "Durak yok, yola devam" which means "No stations keep going on" on screens where passengers normally see the indication: "will stop in the next

station”. This was a clear allusion to the slogan of the government party (AKP) “Don't Stop, Keep Going On!”

Final online example is *Politabiler*. Bobiler created an extension on Google Chrome and changed the names of politicians as: Tayyip Erdoğan -> Tinky Winky-; Devlet Bahçeli -> Laa-Laa; Kemal Kılıçdaroğlu -> Po; Selahattin Demirtaş -> Dipsy; Ahmet Davutoğlu -> Umpie-Pumpie. I quote from the summary of their extension: “The sun is setting in the sky. The extension will be loved by those who download it. Will embrace those who were tired of politics and political news! [...] One, two, three, four, go and download the extension and run over the green hills. Auuw Uvuu.” This extension reminds us an artistic production: Newstweek is “*a device for manipulating news read by other people on wireless hotspots. Built into a small and innocuous wall plug, the Newstweek device appears part of the local infrastructure, allowing writers to remotely edit news read on wireless devices without the awareness of their users.*” Its slogan is “fixing the facts.” Politabiler works in a different manner; it’s a browser extension whoever heard about it can download it and have this experience anywhere there is internet connection; just the user have to heard about it, and in a politically polarized countries such as Turkey it is not that difficult. But in Newstweek’s case, the artists who created this tool they stayed in artistic or hacker environments, they installed the tool over Europe but we don’t have the information how many people realized that their newspaper content was hacked. That’s because we believe that Politabiler will probably reach more people than Newstweek did. On the other hand, it is obvious that Newstweek was criticizing media in a sophisticated manner, they had over 50 editors who were ‘fixing the facts’ which remind us the famous 1984 of George Orwell. Politabiler also criticizes politicians and the media but stays

1st International Conference in Contemporary Social Sciences - Rethymno, 10 - 12 June 2016
Crisis and the Social Sciences: New Challenges and Perspectives

more playful and accessible than Newstweek. This last example was a very recent one, but the humoristic and ironic projects we have been witnessing are not born with Gezi, they always existed and there will always be newcomers. We will be continuing to analyze those projects to investigate the relationship between daily life, politics, arts and aesthetics.

Conclusion

In conclusion, in this article we have made a summary of new forms, repertoires of action, in theory and in practice. We focused on transnational exchange/share of directories and creative mobilizations. By doing it we noticed that there is a new language in these examples, and we traced the impact of this verbal and visual language before, during and after the Gezi movement in Turkey. Finally, we cited online activist productions and web projects which can be linked to Turkish resistance movement. We discovered the creative and disruptive actions and productions, and the importance of language in this process. To sum up, our future plan is to expand our search to other countries and try to present a comparative approach between countries where the resistance or the indignant movements occurred, such as Greece, USA, Egypt and Tunisia.

Bibliography

Books:

- CASTELLS M., 2010. *The Rise of the Network Society*. Massachusetts: MIT Press
CASTELLS M., 1999. *L'Ere de l'information, tome 3 : Fin de millénaire*. Paris: Fayard
DEWEY J., 1934. *Art as Experience*, London: Penguin Books
ERTUR B., SOKMEN M.G., and BORA E., 2008. *Ajanda: Yaratici Direniş*. Istanbul: Metis
LEFEBVRE H., 1974. *La production de l'espace*. Paris: Editions Anthropos
LEFEBVRE H., 1958. *Critique de la vie quotidienne*. Paris: L'Arche

- MARCUSE H., 1972. *Counterrevolution and revolte*. Boston: Beacon Press
- NEVEU E., 1996. *Sociologie des mouvements sociaux*. 6th edition. Paris: La Découverte
- RANCIERE J., 2009b. *Aesthetics and Its Discontents*. Cambridge and Malden: Polity Press
- SCOTT J. C., 1990. *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. New Haven & London: Yale University Press
- SCOTT J. C., 1985. *Weapons of the weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance*, New Haven & London: Yale University Press
- TILLY C., 1977. *From Mobilization to Revolution*. Michigan: University of Michigan
- TOURAIN A., 2005. *Un nouveau paradigme*. Paris: Fayard
- VAN DE DONK W. et al., 2004. *Cyberprotest: New Media, Citizens and Social Movements*, London: Routledge

Journal Articles:

- BERTHO A., 2010. Les émeutes dans le monde en 2009: ethnographie de la colère, *Revue internationale et stratégique*, vol.3, n° 79, 75-85
- BRECHT B., 1936. On Chinese Acting. Translated by Eric Bentley. *The Tulane Drama Review*, 6.1 (1961), 130-136
- GÖLE N., 2014. Démocratie de la place publique: l'anatomie du mouvement Gezi. *Socio*, 3, 351-365
- GRAEBER D., 2013. On the Phenomenon of Bullshit Jobs. *Strike Magazine*, August 17, 2013, [accessed January 2, 2015], <http://strikemag.org/bullshit-jobs/>
- GRAEBER D., 2011. On the Phenomenology of Giant Puppets: broken windows, imaginary jars of urine, and the cosmological role of the police in American culture, <https://libcom.org/files/puppets.pdf>
- GUREL P., 2015. Bilingual Humor, Authentic Aunties, and the Transnational Vernacular at Gezi Park. *Journal of Transnational American Studies*, 6(1)
- JORDAN J. and WHITNEY J., 2001. Resistance is the Secret of Joy. *New Internationalist*, Issue: 338, Septembre <http://newint.org/features/2001/09/05/secret/> [accessed January 13 2016]
- KALATHIL S. and BOAS T., 2003. Open Networks, Closed Regimes: The Impact of the Internet on Authoritarian Rule. *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*
- LACHAUD J-M., Du «Grand refus» selon Herbert Marcuse. *Actuel Marx*, 1/2009, n° 45, 137-148
- LISIAK A., 2014. The Ballerina and the Blue Bra: Femininity in Recent Revolutionary Iconography. *Widok Teorie i praktyki kultury wizualnej*, N°5 Queer obrazy, [accessed January 13 2016] <http://pismowidok.org/index.php/one/article/view/162/290>
- POCOCK J.G.A., 1973. Verbalizing a Political Act: Toward a Politics of Speech. *Political Theory*, Vol.1, N°.1. February, 27-45
- RANCIERE J., 2009a. The Aesthetic Dimension: Aesthetics, Politics Knowledge. *Critical Inquiry* 36, Autumn
- TUFEKCI Z., 2014. Social Movements and Governments in the Digital Age: Evaluating a Complex Landscape. *Journal of International Affairs*. Fall-Winter 2014, Vol. 68, N°. 1

Articles:

- CROSBIE V., 2002. *What's New Media* [viewed 2 January 2015]. Available from: www.sociology.org.uk/as4mm3a.doc
- DURUKAN A., June 24 2005, Biri Bizi Gözetlemesin Festivali, *BIA Haber Merkezi, Bianet, İstanbul* [viewed 24 June 2005]. Available from: <https://bianet.org/bianet/insan-haklari/62852-biri-bizi-gozetlemesin-festivali>
- QUIT (Queers Undermining Israeli Terrorism), *Queer "Settlers" Land on Berkeley Starbucks, Analogy to Israeli Colonists* [viewed 12 January 2015]. Available from: https://www.indybay.org/newsitems/2002/08/18/1414331.php?show_comments=1
- Surveillance Camera Players: 10-Year Report* (published 10 December 2006) [viewed 2 January 2015]. Available from: <http://www.notbored.org/10-year-report.html>
- Surveillance Camera Players, Arte*, [viewed 12 December 2015]. Available from: <http://www.arte.tv/fr/surveillance-camera-players/342176,CmC=342180.html>
- SKY Türkten ilginç protesto, *internethaber*, published 24 October 2007, [viewed 2 January 2015]. Available from: <http://www.internethaber.com/sky-turktenmbspilginc-protesto-110237h.htm>
- ÖZDAL H., 2011. Gözümüz Atina'da, *Radikal*, 13 November 2011 [viewed 2 January 2015]. Available from: <http://www.radikal.com.tr/turkiye/gozumuz-atinada-1069336/>
- Dada, 2009. *Visual Arts Database* [viewed 22 January 2015]. Available from: <http://themoonscheese.wikidot.com/dada>

Websites:

- Noborder camp: <http://www.noborder.org/about.php.html>
- Reclaim The Streets Action Archive: <http://rts.gn.apc.org/archive.htm>
- LAF – Liseli Anarsist Faaliyet: <http://istanbul.indymedia.org/comment/387130>
<https://www.facebook.com/media/set/?set=a.571838912863985.1073741894.127983267249554&type=1>
- Allah Hepsinin Belasını Versin Partisi: <http://ufukfb.blogspot.fr/2007/08/allah-hepsinin-belasn-versin-partisi.html>
- Hoax News Websites: <http://zaytung.com/index.asp> , <http://www.theonion.com/> ,
<http://www.elkoshary.com/> , <http://www.tokoulouri.com/> , <http://www.lerpesse.com/> ,
<http://www.eljueves.es/>
- Safak Basgan: <https://www.facebook.com/safakbasgan>
- Avareler: www.facebook.com/pages/Avareler
- Newstweek: <http://newstweek.com/>